Interactive comment on “Where do we need additional in situ aerosol and sun photometer data?: a critical examination of spatial biases between MODIS and MISR aerosol products” by Y. Shi et al.

M. Mishchenko (Referee)

mmishchenko@giss.nasa.gov

Received and published: 9 September 2011

The other three reviews of this manuscript are quite comprehensive and instructive. I agree with most of those comments and suggestions and believe that the paper should be published after an extensive but mostly technical revision.

I will add just two personal comments.

The second paragraph on page 4298 is the manifest of this manuscript and reads...
as if proposing something that has not been done before. I believe that this needs to be corrected. Indeed, this programmatic approach was put forth and used extensively in Refs. [1–3] (and probably in other publications?), which should be acknowledged explicitly. This would not diminish the originality of the manuscript, but would put it in a proper factual context.

Similarly, the left-hand panels of Fig. 3 reveal the basic patterns well seen in the upper left panel of Fig. 3 in [3] (see the erratum in [4]) and discussed briefly therein. This should also be discussed.
